

Money, Murder, and Cows Part 2  
Scott Moody

**Marie:** A Family Annihilator is, in most cases, a middle-aged man who is perceived as a hard-working and loving husband and father - highly educated with at least an undergrad and maybe even a postgraduate degree, with a good job. He is usually the senior man of the house. He might also be paranoid, depressed, intoxicated, or a combination of all of these. This individual might suffer from depression, psychological problems, and self-destructiveness. This kind of family murderer usually kills each member of the family - sometimes even the pets of the house. In most cases, he will commit suicide after killing his entire family.

(Musical Theme) Ring around the rosies; A pocket full of posies; Ashes ashes; We all fall down.

**Sherry:** Welcome to the Parricide Podcast. I'm Sherry...

**Marie:** ...and I'm Marie.

**Sherry:** Aand today we're presenting Part Two of Money, Murder, and Cows.

**Marie:** If you haven't listened to Part One, you most definitely need to do that first. There is no way you can get up to speed without it. We'll wait right here for you.

**Sherry:** Before we begin, we would like to thank Rob St. Clair for all of the work he has put into this case. He is the author of the book, *Saving Stacy: The Untold Story of the Moody Massacre*. This is a fantastic book, and we draw from it extensively for Part Two of this episode. If you're interested in the case, this book is must-read material.

Scott Robert Moody was born on July 12, 1986 - a Saturday. In a small farming community, like Bellefontaine, Ohio, he was considered to be a very lucky baby. Land is important in farming communities, for obvious reasons, and Scott's family owned a lot of it. For the past century his family had owned and farmed this land and named it Sha-Ker Farm. We couldn't confirm it, but we suspect it was a play on Scott's grandmother's name. She was Sharyl (S-h-a-r-y-l) Sue Buroker Schafer. She was an only child, a devout Methodist, and she was born on this farm. She lived here from cradle to grave. Hence, the name S-H-A (Sha) from Sharyl, and Ker from her last name, Buroker.

Raised in the local Methodist church she married the love of her life, Gary Shafer - who was a Baptist, at the age of 20. She and Gary moved into one of the rentals on her mother's property, and together they took over duties on the family farm; raising prized show horses and dairy cows. But Sharyl and Gary both had day jobs, too. Gary was an architect for a local construction company and Sharyl taught at the local elementary school. Such is the reality of modern-day farming. The family usually works to sustain the land, not the other way around. The farm - the land - had been the family homestead for a little over a century and it meant a lot to all of them. Sharyl's mother, Wilma, ruled the farm with an iron hand. It was kind of easy. See - Gary loved his wife Sharyl and would do anything she asked of him, and Wilma ruled Sharyl. Remember, Gary was a Baptist when he and Sharyl decided to marry? Well, now he was a Methodist. Just like that!

Wilma had personally worked to grow the farm into a tiny empire; complete with rentals and outbuildings. Gary was now the farm manager, but Wilma was still in charge. And she knew what she

wanted to happen. She wanted the family farm to remain in the family, along with peace. She insisted that Sharyl and Gary have only one child saying her one child rule needed to be followed to ensure family members did not feud when she finally died. She always said, "One child is simply enough for each generation - allowing each family, in turn, to prosper without unnecessary arguments." She knew the infighting could quickly waste the profitability of a farm, and she wanted to ensure that did not happen here. So, at Wilma's insistence [Sharyl] and Gary had one - and only one - child, Sheri Kay Shafer. She went by Kay. Kay grew up knowing that one day she would have a hand in keeping the family farm alive and well. Her mother was sweet, her father was strong, and her grandmother was a terror. She didn't get along well with her grandmother, and she knew good old grandma believed that she was always making poor decisions. When she turned 17, Kay fell in love with 20-year-old Steve Moody; a boy she'd met at the County Fair. Wilma protested the relationship. You'd think she would have liked him. He went along with her theme.

**Marie:** What theme?

**Sherry:** Well, the farm - She-Ker - after Sharyl Buroker – herself. And her daughter was Sheri Kay - kind of like Sharyl and Kay. And Steve was a Moo-dy; for a cow farm. (laughter) Okay, it's a dad joke but I liked it.

**Marie:** That's a little corny. (laughter)

**Sherry:** I don't think they raised corn. Hah!

Anyway, Kay believed in love and she married him despite her grandmother's protestations .

**Marie:** Never a good idea.

**Sherry:** You're right. Steve moved easily into the farm with her, and they quickly had two children - Scott and Stacy. But not too quickly - this was not a shotgun wedding. Although Wilma loved both of her great-grandchildren, it distressed her beyond reason to watch Kay ignoring her advice against marrying Steve and then having more than one child. Kay was so very irresponsible! And Wilma feared Kay would be unable to keep the farm unencumbered with family drama based on her decisions.

Five years after the ill-advised marriage - in March of 1990 - Kay was looking for a good divorce attorney and started the scandal of the century in Bellefontaine. In between very public brawls, accusations of cruelty, screaming matches, and broken promises Steve and Kay tried dating, reconciliation, and even counseling. The divorce dragged on.

Kay was still living on the farm, but she was bored. So, she hired a sitter or two and tried to find where she fit now in life. Her old high school friends were a bad fit, because they - now in their mid-20s - were finding love, making plans to marry, or enjoying the honeymoon phases of their own new marriages. She went to church. But that was a bad fit, too. She wanted to find a group of friends who wanted to party hardy and forget about the future for a bit. Those guys simply weren't at church. She didn't want to wait until she divorced to have a little bit of fun, and she started up an affair with the old guy who farmed leased land at the edge of her Grandma's property. His name was John Martin, and he moved in with Kay and her kids right in the middle of the divorce. The town was on fire with gossip, and Wilma was mortified! But Kay grew bored of John fairly quickly and wanted to get rid of him. She filed a complaint

of child abuse with Children's Services, who swooped in to save the day - only to end with a case full of Unfounded Allegations. Scott had said nothing she claimed had ever happened.

But this was the era of abuse claims being made in efforts to gain the upper hand in divorces and Kay took that bull by the horns. Kay began filing myriad claims of sexual abuse against Steve during his visitation, requesting the children be removed from the visit. All allegations were deemed unfounded, but the kids were being cheated of a relationship with their father and stepmother. Kay hit her dad up for help with her legal fees pertaining to the divorce. Her dad agreed to help her, and she hired a new attorney with a bulldog reputation. But he quit - citing Kay's hostile behavior. Finally, on August 31, 1992 Steve and Kay were no longer married. Everyone was exhausted but the fighting just kept going. Court documents indicate the children were most definitely used as bullets in those fights.

**Marie:** How did Scott and Stacy fare with all of this chaos and dissention?

**Sherry:** Well, both Scott and Stacy grew up with very little affinity for their father and stepmother. It may have been all the interference Kay ran using Children's Services -or it might have been things people said about him in front of them. Scott often said it was because his dad cheated on his mom. But it also could have just been a personality mismatch.

They continued to live on the farm with their mom. The kids were lucky to have their grandparents and great-grandmother on hand during their growing-up years. They could fill in when Kay was dealing with her latest crisis, and they could ensure Scott and Stacy both grew up respecting the land - and the animals on it - via hard work and early chores. Scott and Stacy spent their childhoods going to school, attending church at the First United Methodist Church, helping out on the farm, and raising animals in both the 4-H and Future Farmers of America. They both earned ribbons and trophies at the County and State Fairs by showing the animals they had raised and cared for.

Steve fared better than Kay after the divorce. He married the woman that he had been dating, named Audrey, one month after the divorce was final. Together, they built a good life and had a family of their own. Her daughter and their four sons. The daughter, Nikki, and Stacy became very close as they grew up; despite Steve and Kay continuing to fight.

Kay had chosen marriage over college, but she now realized her financial future looked fairly bleak. She was a child of relative privilege - and working low paying jobs would prove difficult for her. She would apply for a job, get the job, and quit the job within a few weeks. Kay landed an okay job with the Department of Transportation, but - according to Saving Stacy - was written up for refusing to perform job assignments if she believed they were beneath her. She wasn't a team player - she wasn't going to do chores like lawn mowing - which were beneath her and she really didn't want to work. She just needed a paycheck.

During her employment with the Department of Transportation, Kay was involved in two non-work-related auto accidents.

**Marie:** That's a horrible luck.

**Sherry:** That is. The first one was right after she started working, and they kept her on. After the second one, the doctors (fresh to the opioid explosion created by Purdue Pharmaceuticals and unaware of the opioid crisis that was in its infancy) sent her home with a pile of painkillers. She sued the last driver, and

won. But most of her money went to supporting her new Substance Use Disorder. She began buying pills on the street. It was about this time that Wilma, who lived up the street, noticed a stream of male visitors and police officers visiting Kay's home. All Wilma could see was the fact that Kay would never be fit to inherit the family farm. She would simply waste the inheritance, and nothing would be left for Scott and Stacy when it was their turn to enjoy the benefits of her lifetime of labor. So, Wilma devised a plan that would allow her to reach into future generations to protect her wealth until there was an heir who she felt was fit to care for the cows without squandering the family wealth. Except what she did next is exactly what led to the ultimate destruction of the farm and most of her progeny.

(interlude music)

**Sherry:** Wilma started sharing her plan with her attorney. That attorney retired, so Wilma found herself a new attorney; a young barrister who did not know the family members nor the history of her case. Wilma decided her Will would split her farm into two parcels upon the death of Sharyl and Gary. Half of the land would be tied up with Life Trusts that would - well this is a little simplified but - the first Life Trust would allow Sharyl and Gary to live on and gain benefit from the Sha-Ker Farm for their entire lives. But they would never actually own the land. They couldn't sell the farm and they would be accountable to a Trustee to whom they would have to make periodic reports to prove they were performing. Upon their deaths, Kay would inherit - holding her own Life Trust.

**Marie:** So, the granddaughter, Kay, would have a Life Trust over half the farm. When Wilma died, Gary and Sharyl - her daughter - would have a Life Estate over the whole farm. And then when they died, Kay would have a Life Estate over half of the farm.

**Sherry:** Right.

**Marie:** And then when she died, Wilma's great-grandchildren - Stacy and Scott - would have actual ownership of one half of what Wilma left behind.

**Sherry:** Right. So, in effect they would each have a quarter of the farm when it finally fell to them.

**Marie:** Oh. Okay, it would just be a long way coming.

**Sherry:** Right.

**Marie:** Okay. So, then the other thing is that Kay didn't actually own any of the farm at the time of the deaths. Not only because she would never really own it - just a Life Estate - but also because her parents were still alive. So, that doesn't really fit with the narrative that the media was portraying, and a lot of people in the community kept saying - that she owned part of the farm and there was, kind of, this fight with her and her parents over ownership of the farm.

**Sherry:** You're right. A lot of the community did not understand what that Will said. So, they would go around saying, 'Oh, Grandma had written a bad Will and that's what the problem is.' The reality is Kay was lying to everyone. She was telling them that she had inherited the farm. So, she would say, 'I inherited all of the farm (or a portion of the farm) on my grandmother's death.' And then she would tell them that there was this court action going on because her grandmother had written a bad Will. Which is where I think that bad Will came from.

**Marie:** So, it wasn't really a bad Will. It just wasn't what she expected or wanted.

**Sherry:** You're right! Technically, it was a really decent Will. But not really - because she didn't really tell her children what she was going to do. She'd clearly left the farm to Sharyl and Gary as a Life Estate, but she hadn't told them first. And so, Gary had expected to inherit the farm, along with Sharyl. And, as the Manager who had spent his life working that farm, was very disappointed when that didn't happen.

**Marie:** Oh, that's understandable. He'd worked his whole life there.

**Sherry:** Right. So that was the first problem with the Will...was lack of communication.

**Marie:** Okay.

**Sherry:** A Life Estate is not a typical way to handle something like this - and that would be a nasty surprise to the family.

**Marie:** Yeah. And it would be hard to realize, after she died, that she didn't really trust you to manage the farm.

**Sherry:** Right. And, unfortunately, it wasn't them she didn't trust as much as it was Kay. But second, she named Sharyl as the executor. And Sharyl did not seem to have the wherewithal to perform the duties of an Executor - and that's really where the true problems lay. Legally speaking, there were some better legal instruments she could have used to accomplish this.

**Marie:** Yeah. It sounds like, maybe, this was kind of a makeshift way to try and get the land to her great-grandchildren.

**Sherry:** Yes. It was. But Kay saying that she owned the farm - she knew she didn't own the farm. It was an out-and-out lie. I think Kay realized that that's where her prestige would come from - because she didn't have anything in the community. She didn't go to college, she hadn't established a career...she was divorced.

**Marie:** Yeah. That's hard.

**Sherry:** Right. Kay would not get her turn to run and profit from that farm until her mother died. And at that point, she could live on and gain benefit from the farm but would also still be beholden to that Trustee. It was upon her death that Scott and Stacy would inherit the land to share and share alike. In short, this means Grandma Wilma was betting on Scott, and maybe Stacy, to preserve her \$2 million legacy - but it robbed Gary of the opportunity to own the farm outright after literally working the farm and managing it for years. She had just hoped he would understand. It kept Kay from wasting the farm with her pattern of bad choices. But Wilma was effectively yoking two generations into a servitude that would eventually benefit their own progeny to preserve her dynasty for enjoyment by the third generation. This part of the Will was, admittedly, complex and a little unusual but Wilma felt this was the best thing she could do for her family before dying. But she left out a critical legal phrase...'or to the survivor of them.' Which ended up costing them money in the future - which we'll talk about later.

**Marie:** Okay. But what about this other half of the land that would be split off when Gary and Sharyl died. Where was that supposed to go?

**Sherry:** Oh. She had reserved that half of the land to honor herself and ensure her family would be remembered and respected by future generations. She instructed that the other half of her farm be sold upon the deaths of Sharyl and Gary, and the proceeds would be used to establish the Fuson-Buroker

Memorial Trust. The Educational Trust would be her legacy to the town and ensure her name was remembered for always. Scholarships would be established from the Trust to be granted to college students - the Wilma Buroker Scholarship, the Sharyl B. Schafer Scholarship - it sounded very cool to her.

**Marie:** Yeah, it makes sense that you would want to give back to the community and make sure that your family is remembered.

**Sherry:** Yes, and I feel that that is why she was building a dynasty to start...was because she wanted to be able to leave a legacy for everyone.

**Marie:** Umhmm.

**Sherry:** Well, Wilma signed her new Will on September 9, 1994. On July 15, 1995 Wilma passed away - at peace because she had done everything within her power to ensure the farm would still be there for Scott and Stacy. Her big mistake was, honestly, who she named as her Executor. Sharyl was the Executor, but she was as nonchalant about this duty as she was about everything in her life. For example, she realized the property was improperly valuated, but she didn't do anything about it - wasting estate money by letting it be taxed at an inflated rate. She also was late in filing the Estate Tax Return, and then she filed it incorrectly and had to amend it - which wasted tens of thousands of dollars in late fees and fines.

According to the New York Times, the farm began to fall into disrepair, and it continued to do so over the decade following her death. It was overgrown; it produced very little milk. Gary had seemed to lose interest in managing the farm - or perhaps he'd always succeeded in the past because Wilma had told him what to do. On paper, Gary and Sharyl had a couple of million dollars - but that isn't how it was translating into real life. Running the farm commanded the efforts and the sacrifices of the entire family and it took its toll on everyone.

Kay felt she was a sharper businesswoman than her mother, so she did some research on her own on the property valuations and what she felt was owed to her and her kids. And then she found an attorney of her own. She found a second attorney to bring a lawsuit representing her personal interest in her grandmother's estate. Kay wanted her money. Somewhere in the middle of this, Kay married a man named Steve Wolfe. That was in 1998, and he was gone by October of 2003. In 2003 Sharyl missed yet another probate court deadline and Kay filed a motion to have her mother removed as the Executor. Sharyl was not in any hurry to finish up probate. Seven long years passed. She kept finding herself non-compliant with the courts. Kay complained that the distribution of assets had not happened and brought it to everyone's attention that the taxes on the property had not been paid since her grandmother's death and rents from properties had not even been collected.

**Marie:** Why had they not started foreclosure actions on the farm for non-payment of taxes?

**Sherry:** Well, the County Treasurer said that they don't - as a matter of practice - foreclose on properties that are in probate. They did owe a lot in back taxes, but shortly before the murders they had made arrangements to make some monthly payments and get that caught up as the estate came out of probate. Sharyl had a fiduciary duty toward all parties and Kay was pointing out that she was wasting that asset with her negligence.

**Marie:** That's too bad. It doesn't sound like Sharyl ever wanted to manage the farm.

**Sherry:** No. It sounds like Sharyl enjoyed the benefits of the farm, but had never had to manage the farm.

**Marie:** Yeah, I mean she sounds like she was much more interested in teaching children and showing ponies than any of this financial stuff.

**Sherry:** I agree. Well, this Motion of Kay's set off a series of discussions within the family which eventually led to an Agreed Judgment Entry being filed with the courts in 2005 - just a few months before the murders. This document formalized the family agreement on how to distribute the assets of the estate. The agreement set aside \$375,000 for the anticipated donation to the Logan County Education Foundation - but that would require the sale of land. The small home in Bellefontaine would be sold. Another piece of farm property - that was not part of Sha-Ker Farms - would be sold. The farmhouse at 2285 State Route - along with 115 acres - would be sold. And Kay's home - along with a barn and one acre - would be sold; with Kay reserving the First Right of Refusal.

Kay was very excited about this! She told her boyfriend, Dave Cusick, that she had been approved for this loan the evening before the murders. Things were really looking up for her!

That's kind of a lot. So, let's take a little break here.

(musical interlude)

**Sherry:** In our last episode, we talked about that pre-graduation party that happened the night before the murders. Let's talk about what really happened the night of the pre-graduation party. It's not clear if the media was given misinformation or just not enough information to actually get a clear picture of what happened - but here is what actually happened based on interviews with various players as reported by Rob St. Clair in Saving Stacy and by Stacy in the documentary, Porcelain Dolls.

On the night of the party, Kay called her 25-year-old friend-with-benefits, Jason, and asked him if he wanted to go to dinner.

**Marie:** How old was Kay when she died?

**Sherry:** 37.

**Marie:** Oh. So, he was 10 years younger.

**Sherry:** Yes, he was. He actually started coming over to the farm because he wanted to date Stacy, who was 15.

**Marie:** Eww!

**Sherry:** I know. He said that when she turned down his advances, he decided to go with Kay instead.

**Marie:** That's gross! She's a child!

**Sherry:** She was a child, you're right! She had just sent her boyfriend, Dave, home to his wife - reminding him to pick up flowers...

**Marie:** Okay, so what's going on here? Dave's her boyfriend, but he has a wife - and she's got another friend-with-benefits?

**Sherry:** Yes. I kind of get the feeling that Kay was polyamorous - and I think this Dave guy was a cheater. He was obviously a cheater. I know in this day and age some people elect to be in polyamorous relationships, but there are rules of engagement. The first and foremost being that all parties are aware that they are not in a monogamous relationship. Dave's wife well, she was his common-law wife and she was not aware of his relationship with Kay. So he was just your common, run-of-the-mill cheater face.

**Marie:** Oh.

**Sherry:** He was reportedly the man who would help Kay around the farm every morning. He was also known around town as a drug dealer

**Marie:** So, all around a shady guy.

**Sherry:** All around a definitely shady guy. According to his police interview, he and Kay had struck up an affair early on in their hired hand arrangement. When asked about his impression of Scott during police interviews, he reportedly told the police he thought of Scott as a little backward.

**Marie:** Like stupid? Or like straight-laced?

**Sherry:** I'm thinking he meant straight-laced. He was a drug dealer, and it sounds like Scott was kind of boring to someone like a drug dealer. So, I would say backward in that way.

**Marie:** Okay.

**Sherry:** Anyway, Jason (the friend-with-benefits) accepted the invitation and he and Kay went to the Red Lobster. It was 30 minutes away in Lima. All of the kids had gone wilding. There were a lot of pre-game parties for the next day's graduation, and they were celebrating hard.

While Jason and Kay were in Walmart at about 9:30 - buying Scott a graduation card - the kids called to say they'd invited a few of their friends back to the house. Jason said Kay was a very liberal mother. She would buy the beer for the kids who were partying at her house. But she - here's where he thinks she was a good mom - she wouldn't let them leave to go home if they were too drunk. Once home, the kids asked if they could get some party supplies. So, Kay and Jason left again, and brought back burgers from Wendy's and a case of beer. At the time Scott, his girlfriend (Paige), Stacy, Bret, and Megan were there. They played pool, watched a movie, and played on the three-wheelers a bit.

Later in the evening Andrew Denney showed up for Stacey. He and Stacy had a beer with the others and then immediately went upstairs to Stacy's room. Paige was very drunk, but Scott and Paige soon followed suit - while Megan and Bret crashed separately in the living room.

**Marie:** Okay. So, we know that Paige was there.

**Sherry:** Right.

**Marie:** But how does a 14-year-old get permission to spend the night at her 18-year-old boyfriend's house?

**Sherry:** Well, her dad wanted to go hunting in Michigan for the weekend and he'd arranged for Paige to stay there for the entire weekend.

**Marie:** Hmm. So, her dad must have been fairly liberal, too.

**Sherry:** I would think so; given that he had asked for her to stay there for the entire weekend.

**Marie:** Yeah.

**Sherry:** Anyway, Bret started on the living room floor passed out. Remember, this is Scott's best friend. But by the time Jason left in the morning, he had moved to the couch. Jason and Kay spent the evening together until approximately 3 30 a.m. At that point, all of the kids were still in the house - and Jason left. Jason told the investigators that he had never seen guns in the house, but he knew Kay gave a mutual friend two pistols to hold when she was going through a divorce. Jason said that Kay had once told him that Scott had a hot temper - like his dad. But Jason had never personally seen anything that confirmed this. The night of the party, Scott had been a little upset that his girlfriend had gotten so drunk, but he was really excited about graduating. In fact, he had very little to drink that night - saying he did not want to walk at graduation with a hangover. So, he was definitely planning on walking for graduation and happily thinking about his future.

Jason also told the investigators that although he was aware of Kay's relationship with Dave. He wasn't sure if Dave was completely aware of his relationship to Kay. So, again, not a polyamorous relationship - just more cheating.

**Marie:** Okay, interesting. Lots of options for jealousy and you'd think some of those men would have been investigated.

**Sherry:** Right. You would think so, given everything that happens.

So, remember the opening part of Part One of this episode? It relayed the story of how the Moody family was murdered based on media reports. Let's go back and review that using evidence and police interviews with friends and family to see how the picture changes.

**Marie:** The sun was peeking over the horizon wondering if this lazy Sunday morning was worth waking up for. Life starts early on a farm, and animals don't care if there's a pre-graduation party. They still want to be fed, milked, and cared for. Bret, Scott's best friend, had spent the night - along with Paige Elizabeth Harshberger, and Megan Renee Karus. But he got up at 6 a.m. to head home and do the morning chores. He understood and accepted the farming life, and he knew that the cows wouldn't wait.

**Sherry:** Bret said Kay wasn't up, yet. That he'd tiptoed into her bedroom, woke her, and said he needed to get home. Kay got up, walked him to the door, unlocked it, and invited him back for breakfast later.

**Marie:** She had to unlock the front door?

**Sherry:** That's what he said in testimony. I did double check that. I'm not sure why the house was locked from the inside.

**Marie:** Or why he couldn't just unlock it himself.

**Sherry:** Sometimes it's a double key -so you have to have a key to lock it and unlock it - and it sounds like Kay would lock everyone in and take the key.

**Marie:** Oh, okay.

**Sherry:** So, that's a little bit interesting when your boyfriend is a drug dealer.

**Marie:** It's, uh, it's very interesting. Um, maybe that's what he meant but when he said she didn't let the kids drive drunk - they couldn't drive drunk because she had them locked in.

**Sherry:** That's very possible. Anyway, he didn't know Andrew, and Andrew had shown up after he'd passed out. But Bret did notice the fancy truck in the driveway as he headed home that morning.

**Marie:** And that was Andrew's truck - the boy who came to see Stacy?

**Sherry:** Yes.

**Marie:** Okay. He left his best friend's house happy; not knowing it would be his last time there. Farmers rise early to care for every living thing...

**Sherry:** ...and everyone in this small town seemed to be getting an early start for the day. Roger Tangerman, during his police interview, reported seeing a car pull into Gary and Sharyl's place early Sunday morning. He only noticed it because he happened to be looking out his front window. Two men got out - one went to the front door to knock and the other - a gray-haired man - went around the side of the house toward the barn.

**Marie:** That's super creepy. That sounds like the one's going to the front door to distract them, and the other one's going to break in.

**Sherry:** That's a fairly common plan of attack.

**Marie:** For, like, robbers.

**Sherry:** Yes. Mr. Tangerman went to make himself a cup of coffee. And when he returned to his window, he noticed only one of the men coming out, getting back into the car, and leaving the Shafer's home. He thought he may have seen one of the men before, but he wasn't sure. The investigators didn't ask him what time he thought this was, nor did they seek more details despite this being the second time they had heard about this gray-haired intruder.

**Marie:** The first time being when Stacy said, "A gray-haired man shot me."

**Sherry:** Exactly! Gary and Sharyl Schafer were preparing for breakfast that morning - just like they did every day. The orange juice was poured, and the eggs were out - ready to be cooked - when the Shafers were murdered. Gary and Sharyl died together there on the kitchen floor. The autopsies would reveal they had both been killed by a Kill Switch. Each of them shot at least once in the neck behind their ears.

**Marie:** What's a Kill Switch - is that a kind of gun?

**Sherry:** No. It's actually - when people who kill other people as a habit acknowledge the way they kill, they'll talk about two different kinds of shots that you can take. A Timer is a shot to the body that causes a person to bleed out and then die.

**Marie:** Oof.

**Sherry:** Yeah, and the shot starts the Timer on the person's life. Hence the name, Timer. If help arrives, the person lives. A Kill Switch is a serious shot that is usually sent through the neck behind the ear - or through the temple. So, it's like a switch. Make the shot, and the life is automatically switched off. So, you use that kind of shot if you definitely want these people to die. And I don't think that Scott was

savvy to this information - especially since he didn't like guns and he had very little experience with them.

**Marie:** Well, that's the way that you kill a human. I would think he would have killed them like you kill a cow – like, right between the eyes.

**Sherry:** As a teenage boy who had lived on a farm - that's what I would think, too. Across the highway, Donna and Roger Smith had gathered with family early this Sunday morning to discuss funeral arrangements for their mother. They heard gunshots at 6:30 a.m. They called to report this fact and they were thanked politely, and no one ever followed up.

**Marie:** 6:30 is an important timeline, because that is before the boy who came to see Stacy – Andrew - that's before he left the house, right?

**Sherry:** Right. That's absolutely right. He was...so they...the murders, it looks like, happened in the Shafer home at 6:30 in the morning. And then one man left in the car – and, as you'll find out soon what happened to the next man, but both of them headed out to the Moody home.

**Marie:** So, that makes it even more unlikely that it's Scott. Because he would have had to have gotten up and snuck out without Bret or Andrew seeing him.

**Sherry:** Absolutely right! So, another early riser was John Martin – Kay's ex - he found himself up getting his crops in early in the morning. What John saw that Sunday morning made his blood run cold. He saw a lonely figure walking along the ridge of the property away from Gary and Sharyl Shafer's house and toward Kay's house. He recognized the man. He knew this stocky man with gray hair, and he noticed that he was wearing a simple blue t-shirt; only because it was chilly that morning and John wondered where his coat was - and why he was walking along the ridge in the cold. John Martin had been around the block enough to know to stay out of the way of this man unless he was willing to put himself and his daughter, Misty, in harm's way. He knew the rumors in town.

**Marie:** Okay, so this gray-haired man wasn't a complete stranger. He'd been seen around before.

**Sherry:** And people knew who he was.

**Marie:** Okay.

**Sherry:** Back at the Moody's, the next to leave the house was Andrew Denny. In his police interview, he said the night before everyone was relaxed and having fun and there was no mention of guns at the party. He and Stacy went upstairs to Stacy's bedroom, and Stacy set the alarm for 6 a.m. so he could get home to help his dad with chores. They'd hit the snooze alarm several times when he left at 7:15. Bret and Megan were still asleep in the living room on their respective sofas and the house was quiet. No one was awake.

**Marie:** How did he see Bret asleep on the couch - if Bret left at six that morning?

**Sherry:** That's a really good question. It's fairly clear that Bret did leave at six in the morning. Not only did he report it, but his father reported that he got home at six and he kind of got in trouble for not letting his dad know he was spending the night - and then they went off to do chores.

**Marie:** And he saw the truck out front that was Andrew. So, we know Andrew was still there when Bret left.

**Sherry:** Right.

**Marie:** So, that leaves the question - who was on the couch? Because it certainly wasn't Brett.

**Sherry:** Now, remember, at 6:30 the gray-haired man was walking along the ridge and the other man - in the car - had already headed to the Moody's.

**Marie:** So, I wonder if one of them had heard the movement upstairs and hid on the couch for a minute - waiting for their friend to get there.

**Sherry:** That would be my guess; and that gives me chills. (sighs)

Anyway, we know the media was led to believe that Scott walked up the country highway to his grandparents' house carrying his gun. But interviews with everyone revealed that Scott didn't like guns. There were a couple of rifles in the house - by the microwave - and one under Kay's bed. But none of them were .22s. Everyone interviewed claimed that if the gun used in the murders came from the farm, it would have had to be Gary's. He was the only one who owned .22s, and he didn't buy used guns. This was a guarantee from his brother, Ron. No one seemed to think it was important to determine where that gun came from, but everyone in town has talked about the fact that Jon Stout's family owned a questionable gun shop - and some have wondered if this is where the gun came from.

**Marie:** So, two disinterested parties - two neighbors - saw a gray-haired man on the Sha-Ker Farm that morning, but no one saw Scott? Because he would have had to go to his grandparents' house somehow.

**Sherry:** That's right. Something to think about, right?

**Marie:** For sure! You can almost see the lonely figure, walking purposefully along the ridge between the Sha-Ker Farm and John Martin's farm. As the distant church bells rang past rolling green pastures and fields of hay - the sky warmly softening from pink to blue - no one would be taking care of the cows today.

**Sherry:** The gray-haired man was finished at the Shafer's, and was heading purposefully toward the Moody home.

**Marie:** That morning the local police would be called to a murder scene. They would find Megan murdered on a couch in the living room; the blankets tucked up under her chin. She had been shot in the neck, behind her ear. Kay was found dead in her bed; with the blankets tucked up under her chin. She had been shot once in the left temple. In Scott's room the police found the body of Paige; again, with the blankets tucked up under her chin - shot once in the left temple. Scott's shirtless body was next to her. He had been shot twice. The first shot was behind his left ear and the second shot had gone through the right side of his mouth. A Marlin rifle was reported to be nearby. The only living witness was Scott's 15-year-old sister, Stacy. She had been shot twice - once in the cheek and once in the neck - and she was rushed to the hospital.

This is the story of a mass shooting blamed on 18 year old Scott Moody as per interview materials gleaned from the scant evidence collected Saving Stacy (the aforementioned book by Rob St. Clair) as well as what friends ,family, and Stacy herself relayed to the local police.

(interlude music)

**Sherry:** So, a couple more things that are kind of interesting. At 10:30 on Sunday, Rita Price, a local coffee shop owner, had a customer come in and ask why State Road 47 was blocked off. She called her husband who turned on his police scanner. He put the phone to the scanner, and the coffee shop listened to the dispatcher saying that police were chasing a man across from the crime scene toward the airport roadway. When the papers came out, they looked for mentions of this chase. There was nothing. A customer finally wrote to the Bellefontaine Examiner questioning the investigation. The customer received a message on her answering machine - and this is a quote, "You'd better keep your mouth shut."

**Marie:** That's ominous.

**Sherry:** It is! I'm wondering who they were chasing that day.

**Marie:** Probably the gray-haired man.

**Sherry:** Quite possibly. At 10:30 you would think he would be gone, though.

**Marie:** You would think so; especially if he was some kind of professional.

**Sherry:** Right. So. there is that.

So on the morning of the shooting, Stacy's stepsister, Nikki, told the police that Stacy had told her the man who did this to her was a stranger. She said, "There was an older guy with gray hair standing there with a gun and I tried to push the gun out of the way."

The investigators seemed to dismiss the information as incorrect - saying they would need to get more information from Stacy when she was able to be interviewed. They figured Stacy must have made a mistake and the investigators continued building their case against Scott. The investigators did not deem this important information to share with the Coroner or with the media. So, remember, the Coroner's visit was the morning of June 1<sup>st</sup>.

**Marie:** When he visited Stacy in the hospital...

**Sherry:** ...and everyone was shocked to hear that it was a gray-haired man - when the coroner questioned Stacy.

**Marie:** Umhmm.

**Sherry:** Right, okay. So, at 10:30 p.m. on June 1st - which is after the coroner's visit - the police Investigators finally showed up at the hospital to interview Stacy.

**Marie:** At 10:30 at night? In the hospital? This is a girl who's been shot twice. They couldn't come before her bedtime?

**Sherry:** Well, before her bedtime - before they'd already closed the investigation - before they before they - before they'd. Anyway, no one had told Stacy that her mother was dead, and her brother had been named as her killer. Stacy was upset and wanted to know where her mother was. The Detectives claim - this is Detective Jon Stout and Detective Bruglar. The Detectives claimed they weren't aware the coroner had already been by for a statement and had learned Stacy's account of the murders. Stacy

reiterated what she told the Coroner. She described waking up and getting shot. Stacy, again, described the gray-haired stranger in the blue shirt as the shooter. After being shot for the second time, Stacy said she thought she passed out. When she came to, she went to find her mom. Her mom was in bed with blood coming out of her mouth. Frightened, she went to find Scott in his bedroom. Scott had a shotgun in his hand pointing toward his face - and there was blood on the wall.

**Marie:** (gasp) That just sounds like a nightmare!

**Sherry:** It does. Stacy made her way downstairs and began shouting at Megan to wake up. In her documentary, she said she wasn't really shouting - because her vocal cord had been severed - but she thought she was. But Megan wasn't moving, either. Stacy said she knocked a bunch of stuff over and collapsed in the recliner. She thinks she fell asleep. I think she passed out. When she came to, she went to the bathroom - and that's when she saw her face. That's when she realized she'd been shot. But Stacy said she thought perhaps John Martin was pranking her - he was an older man with gray hair, too. But she figured he would never scare her like that. And that's when Stacy started calling people.

**Marie:** Is that before - or after - she went and laid back down on her bed.

**Sherry:** It was after she laid down on her bed.

**Marie:** Oh okay.

**Sherry:** So, in the documentary Stacy said that after she came to she went back and laid on her bed - but she did visit the bathroom - based on other testimony.

**Marie:** Okay.

**Sherry:** So, in the documentary, Stacy says that the phone rang - and we know that Dave called to make sure that Kay realized that he couldn't make it to the graduation because he needed to go to the funeral for his wife's mother.

**Marie:** Ah.

**Sherry:** And Stacy heard that phone ringing - and she did pick it up - and Dave said she, like, made some weird, funny noises; which we now understand was because she had a severed vocal cord. And he hung up. And he tried contacting her a couple of times - and he contacted John Martin and he was kind of irritated because he wasn't used to not being able to get hold of Kay.

**Marie:** Oh, okay.

**Sherry:** ...before he realized what had happened. But, anyway, that phone call made Stacy think, "I need to get some help."

So, that's when she started calling people. We know she called John Martin. John was out on his tractor, remember, and he was still on his tractor when the call came in. He said he answered the phone, and the caller said, "Daddy..." And he knew it was Stacy - because she was the only person in the world who'd ever called him daddy. But he couldn't understand what she said. He was really pressed for time. He needed to get the crops in. So he said, "Stacy, I can't understand." He explained that he would call her back after he got his crops in. He hung up his phone and got back on his tractor. He said he'd thought she partied too much, perhaps, the night before - and was maybe just a little bit drunk still. She also

called his daughter, Misty, and left a message on her voicemail at 10:05 a.m. But Misty said the call came through from Kay's phone. And when she heard the message, she thought Stacy was pranking her and had erased the message - just before she heard the sirens.

**Marie:** Ohh, she must have felt awful afterwards.

**Sherry:** I can't imagine. I feel so sorry for everyone who was caught up in this. Stacy finally called Nikki, her stepsister, and the next thing she knew Nikki and Jeff (Jeff's the significant other) were there to help her. Stacy said her family owned three rifles - a 12-gauge and a 20-gauge that they kept by the microwave and a .410 that her mom kept under her bed. Almost everyone - with the exception of Scott's ex-girlfriend, Amanda Arthur, the girl that Scott dated his entire senior year until she broke up with him two weeks prior to graduation - had insisted the family didn't keep rifles; that Scott was afraid of them and didn't shoot them. Stacy said that if the rifle was a .22 it most likely belonged to her grandfather, Gary. This notion was confirmed by all family friends subsequently interviewed by the investigators. Stacy's interview was cut short because of her condition, but the Investigators (Jon Stout and Detective Bruglar) were back the next morning at 10:30 to ask her more questions.

The next morning at 10:30 a.m. - during the second interview - these two same Investigators again asked Stacy to relay the events (as she recalled them) prior to and after the shootings. Stacy was starting to recover and was experiencing more pain. She was tired of answering the same questions over and over again. Stacy repeated that she didn't know her shooter. She, again, described him as a gray-haired stranger with a blue shirt. One of the investigators, Jon Stout; sure she was not remembering correctly, tried to shoehorn her brother into the role of the shooter by asking, "Describe the gun you saw your brother holding."

Confused by the double-barreled question, Stacy answered his question the best she could saying her brother's gun was a pump gun with a wood stock that Scott used for deer hunting. Pleased that his line of questioning had taken them exactly where he wanted the conversation to go, he asked another question with Scott assumptively placed in the role of the shooter. Frustrated with what that Investigator was implying - and upset that he wasn't listening to the answers that cost her so much to formulate - she shouted, "The man I saw was not my brother. The man was older, with gray hair!"

Well, this was awkward. The Sheriff had publicly declared Scott as the killer and closed the case. But the investigators were seeing myriad inconsistencies - and we think you're seeing them, too.

(interlude music)

**Sherry:** So, there's a lot more to this case. We think you've probably realized that it's not a typical parricide case.

**Marie:** Yeah, we could talk about this case until the cows come home.

**Sherry:** (laughter) You're funny!

Anyway, there is a Part Three to this episode. There is so much more to this story that needs telling.

**Marie:** Okay. I guess we will see you all next week, so we can finish up.

**Sherry:** We'd like to thank Jade Brown for our theme music and Rob St. Clair, the author of *Saving Stacy: The Untold Story of the Moody Massacre*, and Stacy Moody Cessna, the producer of the documentary,

Porcelain Dolls: The Stacy Moody Story. We drew a lot of our material from these two sources. We'd also like to thank the Dayton Daily News, the New York Times, the Journal News, and the Bellefontaine Examiner for a variety of information and the photos we used for this show. You can see the photos at [parricide.org](http://parricide.org). Just click on Parricide Podcast once you get to the website.

**Marie:** You can reach out to us at Parricide Podcast on Facebook or Instagram - or simply email us at [parricidepodcast@parricide.org](mailto:parricidepodcast@parricide.org). If you'd like to be a part of working to further parricide research and the making of this podcast, head on over to [patreon.com/parricidepodcast](https://patreon.com/parricidepodcast). Any money donated is tax deductible because we are a 501(c)3 charity and every cent you donate goes directly into not only supporting the production of this podcast but also into the research we are doing to build a model to help identify threats to family safety. Thanks for your support, and we'll see you next week for part three of the Scott Moody story.

**Sherry:** Bye!

**Marie:** Bye for now!

(musical theme) Ashes, ashes; we all fall down.